### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA CHARLESTON DIVISION

IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

**Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327** 

**MDL No. 2327** 

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

WAVE 1 CASES ATTACHED ON EXHIBIT A

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN
U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

# PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE CERTAIN OPINIONS AND TESTIMONY OF NICOLE FLEISCHMANN, M.D.

Plaintiffs, pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 702 and *Daubert*<sup>1</sup> move the Court to exclude certain opinions that Nicole Fleischmann, M.D., an expert for Defendants, has set forth in her general expert report and testified about in her depositions. In support of this motion, Plaintiffs say as follows:

- 1. Defendants have identified Nicole Fleischmann, M.D., as an expert witness in each of the cases listed in Exhibit A to this motion.
- 2. Defendants have produced a general report by Dr. Fleischmann concerning Ethicon's TVT Retropubic sling.
- 3. Dr. Fleischmann's general report expresses opinions that exceed the scope of her expertise. Dr. Fleischmann opines on the material properties of mesh, including pore size, weave, density, degradation, and contracture or shrinkage as well as the TVT's Instructions for Use (IFU). Dr. Fleischmann is not have the necessary education, training, and experience to

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc., 509 U.S. 579 (1993).

testify regarding these matters. Moreover, the methodology Dr. Fleischmann employed in rendering her opinions on these subjects is unreliable.

For the reasons set forth here and in Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law in Support of the Motion, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court enter an order limiting the expert testimony proffered by Nicole Fleischmann, M.D.

This 21 st Day of April, 2016

By: /s/ P. Leigh O'Dell\_\_\_\_\_

ANDY D. BIRCHFIED, JR.
P. LEIGH O'DELL
WESLEY CHADWICK COOK
Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C
218 Commerce Street
Montgomery, Alabama 36104
334-269-2343
andy.birchfield@beasleyallen.com
leigh.odell@beasleyallen.com
chad.cook@beasleyallen.com

#### /s/Thomas P. Cartmell

Thomas P. Cartmell, Esq.
Jeffrey M. Kuntz, Esp.
Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP
4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300
Kansas City, MO 64112
816-701-1102
Fax816-531-2372
tcartmell@wcllp.com
jkuntz@wcllp.com

## /s/ D. Renee Baggett

Bryan F. Aylstock, Esq.
Renee Baggett, Esq.
Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC
17 East Main Street, Suite 200
Pensacola, Florida 32563
(850) 202-1010
(850) 916-7449 (fax)
rbaggett@awkolaw.com
baylstock@awkolaw.com

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on April 21, 2016, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ P. Leigh O'Dell
Attorney for Plaintiffs